

Paul Melillo

Critical Review of Geologic Writing

Geology 371

Review of: "Modern Sediment Yield Compared to Geological Rates of Sediment Generation in a semi- arid Basin, New Mexico- Quantifying the human impact" by Allen C. Gellis

The paper in review is about a study done in the Rio Puerco in New Mexico. Modern short term sediment yields were compared to geological rate of sediment generation. The modern sediment rates were calculated with sediment traps and straw dams were found to exceed long-term sediment yield. Differences between sediment traps and dams were noticed between the alluvial valley floors. The alluvial valley floor is grazed and has a several people man obstructions, so that sediment yields is reprehensive of human activity. This study will determine a model for contrasting human impact on sediment yield.

This paper was very well written and contained a large amount of information to support the conclusions drawn from this study. The quality of the data in this paper is good. The interpretations in the paper were present with supporting evidence and flowed nicely thought the paper. Both the writing and illustrations were present in a clear and concise way, with the illustrations incorporated well to support the writing.

I recommended this paper for submission to a journal of your choice, after a few corrections are made. The methods section could be expanded giving more detail about how measurements were taken from the sediments maybe include some more pictures. I feel that the conclusion is good but left me hanging and need to end on a stronger note.

1. I feel that you could expand more on what this paper is going to address. You give a great introduction but you only introduce what your paper is about at the very last sentence.
2. State how long your study was done for.

3. Expand your method to give more information on how the percentage of vegetation was taken
4. I think that this would be better reformatted to not be questions, or maybe not a question of this type.
5. The end leaves the reader hanging. Try to fix the last sentence to end with a strong statement about you study.